Rule Summary and Fiscal Analysis
Part A - General Questions

Rule Number: 4501:1-3-08
Rule Type: Amendment
Rule Title/Tagline: Place of business required for used motor vehicle dealers.
Agency Name: Department of Public Safety
Division: Bureau of Motor Vehicles
Address: 1970 West Broad Street PO Box 182081 Columbus OH 43218-2081
Contact: Joseph Kirk
Phone: 614-466-5605
Email: jakirk@dps.ohio.gov

I. Rule Summary

1. Is this a five year rule review? No

   A. What is the rule's five year review date? 11/1/2022

2. Is this rule the result of recent legislation? No

3. What statute is this rule being promulgated under? 119.03

4. What statute(s) grant rule writing authority? 4501.02, 4517.32

5. What statute(s) does the rule implement or amplify? 4517.02, 4517.03, 4517.05, 4517.12

6. What are the reasons for proposing the rule?

   The rule is being amended to increase consumer protection.

7. Summarize the rule's content, and if this is an amended rule, also summarize the rule's changes.

   The rule deals with the physical location for used motor vehicle dealers place of business. The changes include eliminating a requirement limiting certain motor vehicle dealers to 10 vehicles or less, as well as adding a requirement businesses be open at least 25 hours per week. These changes have been made to protect consumer who
have not been receiving their certificate of title after dealers vacating their locations, or only having weird hours on the weekends. Additionally, individuals are obtaining a dealer’s license in Ohio so that they may attend auctions in other states and sell via wholesale only. They are not doing any business in Ohio in order to circumvent the sales and use tax.

8. Does the rule incorporate material by reference? No

9. If the rule incorporates material by reference and the agency claims the material is exempt pursuant to R.C. 121.75, please explain the basis for the exemption and how an individual can find the referenced material.

   Not Applicable

10. If revising or re-filing the rule, please indicate the changes made in the revised or re-filed version of the rule.

    Not Applicable

II. Fiscal Analysis

11. Please estimate the increase / decrease in the agency's revenues or expenditures in the current biennium due to this rule.

    This will have no impact on revenues or expenditures.

    0.00

    Not applicable.

12. What are the estimated costs of compliance for all persons and/or organizations directly affected by the rule?

    Costs vary based on the size and type the dealer chooses to utilize.

13. Does the rule increase local government costs? (If yes, you must complete an RSFA Part B). No

14. Does the rule regulate environmental protection? (If yes, you must complete an RSFA Part C). No

15. If the rule imposes a regulation fee, explain how the fee directly relates to your agency’s cost in regulating the individual or business.
III. Common Sense Initiative (CSI) Questions

16. Was this rule filed with the Common Sense Initiative Office? Yes

17. Does this rule have an adverse impact on business? Yes

   A. Does this rule require a license, permit, or any other prior authorization to engage in or operate a line of business? No

      However, this rule sets forth the requirements for a dealer place of business which would go into the license determination.

   B. Does this rule impose a criminal penalty, a civil penalty, or another sanction, or create a cause of action, for failure to comply with its terms? Yes

      Failure to comply with the requirements set forth in this rule may result in denial of a renewal application or in administrative action up to and including revocation of an existing license. Further, in accordance with section 4517.99 of the Revised Code, unless otherwise specifically provided in Chapter 4517. of the Revised Code, whoever violates rules promulgated under sections 4517.01 to 4517.45 of the Revised Code is guilty of a misdemeanor of the fourth degree.

   C. Does this rule require specific expenditures or the report of information as a condition of compliance? Yes

      This rule requires licensees to maintain compliance of all physical requirements of an established place of business for a used motor vehicle dealer’s license.

   D. Is it likely that the rule will directly reduce the revenue or increase the expenses of the lines of business of which it will apply or applies? Yes

      Dealerships may see increased expenses dealing with retail sales and additional required operating hours if they do not currently operate for the minimum 25 hours, however, a large majority of dealers already maintain the requirement.

IV. Regulatory Restrictions (This section only applies to agencies indicated in R.C. 121.95 (A))

18. Are you adding a new regulatory restriction as defined in R.C. 121.95? Yes
A. **How many new regulatory restrictions do you propose adding?** 1

New paragraph (B) states that used motor vehicle dealers are to be open to the public no less than twenty-five hours per week.

B. **How many existing regulatory restrictions do you propose removing?** 2

Paragraph (A)(1)(b) removes the requirement of limiting to ten vehicles or less.

Paragraph (A)(1)(b) removes the requirement of the display area having adequate ground cover of a hard surface....

Although this requirement is retained in new (A)(1), overall, it was previously listed in both (A)(1)(a) and (A)(1)(b) and was counted as such in the original inventory.
Place of business required for used motor vehicle dealers.

(A) A used motor vehicle dealer shall have an established place of business that meets all of the following requirements:

1. Has a display lot or display area that: of no less than three thousand five hundred square feet, not including driveways or office, with adequate ground cover of a hard surface that is free from the collection of dust, mud, water, or other unsightly conditions:
   a. Is at least three thousand five hundred square feet, not including driveways or office, with adequate ground cover of a hard surface that is free from the collection of dust, mud, water, or other unsightly conditions; or,
   b. For those dealers whose retail sales inventory, as defined in division (G) of section 4517.01 of the Revised Code, is limited at all times to ten vehicles or less, the display area has sufficient space for all vehicles being offered for retail sale. The display area must have adequate ground cover of a hard surface that is free from the collection of dust, mud, water, or other unsightly conditions;

2. Except as set forth in paragraphs (B) and (D) of this rule, is separated with a barrier, as defined in this rule, from any residence and from any other business or service facility that is not primarily related to assisting or furthering the selling, displaying, offering for sale, or dealing in motor vehicles. A barrier is a permanent fixture or feature of the property that distinguishes the display lot or area from residences or other businesses, comprised of metal, brick, stone, concrete, wood, heavy support cable, landscaping, curbing, or other comparable feature that creates a distinct space for the display lot. It shall clearly delineate a separation between a residence or an unrelated business and the beginning of the dealership's established place of business. Such separation shall be properly maintained during the entire period for which a used motor vehicle dealer's license is held.

3. Includes a permanent usable structure on the display lot or area that is identifiable as a motor vehicle dealership to the public that includes an easily accessible office of at least a contiguous one hundred eighty square feet with walls of a hard surface and that shall not be used as a storage or other utility area. The office shall include, at minimum, a desk, three chairs, and a filing cabinet, or similar furnishings to create an environment conducive to transacting business, consummating sales, and facilitating the storage of records, all of which shall be kept in a neat and orderly fashion at all times. The office shall include adequate lighting, electrical service, heating and ventilation that is secure and safe for a
retail office environment. The entire premises, including any plumbing fixtures, shall not be in violation of any applicable building and zoning requirements. The dealer shall provide evidence to show building and zoning requirements have been met upon request of the registrar or the registrar's designee. Upon request of the dealer, the registrar of motor vehicles shall consider, and may approve, reasonable variances to these requirements except for variances to the building and zoning requirements;

(4) Has a business telephone in service at all times that shall be answered and identified exclusively for the dealership's business. The business telephone number shall be legible and posted in a conspicuous place in public view. A motor vehicle dealer shall notify the registrar in writing within fifteen days of any change in the business telephone number;

(5) Is open during the posted business hours. The business hours shall be legible and posted in a conspicuous place near the entrance of the office. A motor vehicle dealer shall notify the registrar in writing within fifteen days of any change in the posted business hours;

(6) Is staffed during posted business hours by a sole proprietor, officer of a corporation, trustee of a business trust, or in the case of a partnership or limited liability company, partner or member, or any such entity as defined in division (A) of section 4517.01 of the Revised Code, or a licensed motor vehicle salesperson under sections 4517.09, 4517.14, and 4517.20 of the Revised Code, if the employee engages in the business and could reasonably assist any retail customer.

(B) Ninety days after the effective date of this rule, all licensed used motor vehicle dealers are to be open to the public no less than twenty-five (25) hours a week, with at least ten (10) of those hours being between nine a.m. to five p.m. Monday through Friday. The business hours shall be legible and posted in a conspicuous place near the entrance of the office. A motor vehicle dealer shall notify the registrar in writing within fifteen days of any change in the posted business hours;

(C) A physical barrier between the dealership and service facility; is not required at an established place of business that includes a service facility that is used to perform service on motor vehicles, if the established place of business meets the following requirements:

(1) The service facility is owned and operated by each person listed on the dealer license as a sole proprietor, officer(s) of a corporation, trustee(s) of a business trust, or in the case of a partnership or limited liability company, partner(s) or
member(s), or any such entity as defined in division (A) of section 4517.01 of the Revised Code;

(2) The display lot or area shall have distinguished areas, identified through signage, for motor vehicles that are being repaired, motor vehicles that are being offered for sale, and customer parking;

(3) Notwithstanding the requirement of paragraph (A)(3) of this rule, a private office shall be available that is conducive to transacting business in a confidential manner regarding the sale of a motor vehicle; and

(4) Is staffed during posted business hours by a sole proprietor, officer of a corporation, trustee of a business trust, or in the case of a partnership or limited liability company, partner or member, or any such entity as defined in division (A) of section 4517.01 of the Revised Code, or a licensed motor vehicle salesperson under sections 4517.09, 4517.14, and 4517.20 of the Revised Code, if the employee engages in the business and could reasonably assist any retail customer.

(C)(D) No motor vehicle dealer, its agent, or its representative shall alter the physical conditions of the established place of business so that it is not in compliance with the requirements of Chapter 4517. of the Revised Code.

(E) A dealer may make a written request to the registrar for an exception to the barrier requirements as follows:

(1) The dealer shall present a plan to clearly identify, distinguish and segregate through signage or other measures any vehicles the dealer is offering for sale from any other vehicles that may be present on the premises at any time;

(2) The registrar shall review the plan. If the registrar determines that there is no reasonable health or safety threat to customers, neighbors, or neighboring businesses; that the dealer acted in good faith in buying or leasing the property; and that the dealer has made a reasonable effort to comply with the barrier requirements, but that restrictions imposed by local zoning ordinances or by the lessor prohibit the establishment of a barrier, the registrar, in the registrar's discretion, may approve the plan, approve the plan with modifications, or disapprove the plan.

(F) In the event that a used motor vehicle dealer's license is sought by an applicant that surrenders a new motor vehicle dealer's license, and specific circumstances prevent the location previously used for operation of the new motor vehicle dealership from meeting all of the requirements of section 4517.03 of the Revised Code and this rule,
the registrar may exercise discretion to grant a used motor vehicle dealer's license at said location despite the defect.
Effective:

Five Year Review (FYR) Dates: 11/1/2022

Certification

Date

Promulgated Under: 119.03
Statutory Authority: 4501.02, 4517.32
Rule Amplifies: 4517.02, 4517.03, 4517.05, 4517.12
The Common Sense Initiative is established in R.C. 107.61 to eliminate excessive and duplicative rules and regulations that stand in the way of job creation. Under the Common Sense Initiative, agencies must balance the critical objectives of regulations that have an adverse impact on business with the costs of compliance by the regulated parties. Agencies should promote transparency, responsiveness, predictability, and flexibility while developing regulations that are fair and easy to follow. Agencies should prioritize compliance over punishment, and to that end, should utilize plain language in the development of regulations.
Reason for Submission

1. R.C. 106.03 and 106.031 require agencies, when reviewing a rule, to determine whether the rule has an adverse impact on businesses as defined by R.C. 107.52. If the agency determines that it does, it must complete a business impact analysis and submit the rule for CSI review.

Which adverse impact(s) to businesses has the agency determined the rule(s) create?

The rule(s):

a. ☒ Requires a license, permit, or any other prior authorization to engage in or operate a line of business.

b. ☐ Imposes a criminal penalty, a civil penalty, or another sanction, or creates a cause of action for failure to comply with its terms.

c. ☐ Requires specific expenditures or the report of information as a condition of compliance.

d. ☐ Is likely to directly reduce the revenue or increase the expenses of the lines of business to which it will apply or applies.

Regulatory Intent

2. Please briefly describe the draft regulation in plain language.

This rule sets forth the physical requirements for the established place of business of a used motor vehicle dealership. The proposed amendments are to strengthen the requirements for consumer protection, to eliminate the licensing of those dealerships that may be harmful to consumers, and to curb illegal activities and using the dealership/license as a front.

The proposed amendments consist of rewriting the requirement of a display lot being thirty-five hundred square feet, re-enforcing that the barrier is a permanent fixture or feature, the designated office area must be a space with walls of a hard surface for the protection of individual’s personal information during a sale, and the requirement for used motor vehicle dealerships to be open to the public no less than twenty five hours a week with ten of those hours being nine a.m. to five p.m. Monday thru Friday. The addition of the hours will assist consumers, BMV Investigations, and the Attorney General’s Office in making contact with the owners or authorized personnel.

3. Please list the Ohio statute(s) that authorize the agency, board or commission to adopt the rule(s) and the statute(s) that amplify that authority.
4. Does the regulation implement a federal requirement? Is the proposed regulation being adopted or amended to enable the state to obtain or maintain approval to administer and enforce a federal law or to participate in a federal program? No.

5. If the regulation includes provisions not specifically required by the federal government, please explain the rationale for exceeding the federal requirement. N/A.

6. What is the public purpose for this regulation (i.e., why does the Agency feel that there needs to be any regulation in this area at all)?

There has been an increase in consumers not receiving certificate of titles to their motor vehicles and the dealer not being available for contact by the consumer, BMV Investigations, Dealer Licensing (BMV), and the Attorney General’s Office. Additionally, dealers are vacating their locations or just posting their required two hours on the weekends and not actually being present during those hours. Individuals are also obtaining a dealer’s license in Ohio so that they can attend auctions in other states and wholesale only. They are not actually doing any business in Ohio in order to circumvent the sales and use tax. Those individuals find an established place of business that meets the minimum requirements to get a dealer’s license and then disappear, using their Ohio dealer permit number and Ohio dealer license plates. With the ability for limited space of ten vehicles or less in inventory and the absence of the word permanent in the barrier requirement, individuals are applying for dealer’s licenses in resident garages, backyards, places that are hard to locate; commercial garages and commercial property that are not identifiable as dealerships. There were some locations that were/are being used for illegal activity and multiple complaints from local zoning agencies.

7. How will the Agency measure the success of this regulation in terms of outputs and/or outcomes?

The BMV will measure the success by the number of administrative hearings that are heard by the Motor Vehicle Dealers Board and the number of consumer complaints filed with the Attorney General’s Office as well as BMV Investigations.

8. Are any of the proposed rules contained in this rule package being submitted pursuant to R.C. 101.352, 101.353, 106.032, 121.93, or 121.931? N/A

Development of the Regulation
9. Please list the stakeholders included by the Agency in the development or initial review of the draft regulation.

The BMV has worked in drafting the amended rule with the Ohio Independent Auto Dealers Association (OIADA) and the Ohio Auto Dealers Association (OADA).

10. What input was provided by the stakeholders, and how did that input affect the draft regulation being proposed by the Agency?

Both OIADA and OADA are supportive of the proposed amendments of this rule. The proposed amendments were made in a joint effort.

11. What scientific data was used to develop the rule or the measurable outcomes of the rule? How does this data support the regulation being proposed?

N/A.

12. What alternative regulations (or specific provisions within the regulation) did the Agency consider, and why did it determine that these alternatives were not appropriate? If none, why didn’t the Agency consider regulatory alternatives?

The alternative regulations of the limited space of ten vehicles or less was considered and found to be abused by dealers. Therefore, the BMV and OIADA determined it was best to revert back to the single option of the thirty five hundred square foot lot. The BMV has also received multiple complaints from local zoning agencies. Research shows that most states also require a display lot of a specific square footage and that the dealership files documentation with their local zoning agencies prior to being issued a dealership license.

13. Did the Agency specifically consider a performance-based regulation? Please explain.

Performance-based regulations define the required outcome, but don’t dictate the process the regulated stakeholders must use to achieve compliance.

14. What measures did the Agency take to ensure that this regulation does not duplicate an existing Ohio regulation?

Both the Revised Code and Administrative Code were reviewed to ensure there was no duplication of regulations.

15. Please describe the Agency’s plan for implementation of the regulation, including any measures to ensure that the regulation is applied consistently and predictably for the regulated community.

Notification will be submitted to all dealerships, social media will be utilized, and collaboration with the associations to distribute the plan will also be used. Continued random inspections will continue as a normal course of business which include violation letters and an opportunity for the dealers to come into compliance with the laws and rules.
Adverse Impact to Business

16. Provide a summary of the estimated cost of compliance with the rule. Specifically, please do the following:

a. Identify the scope of the impacted business community; and

   There are currently five thousand five hundred and fifty (5,550) used motor vehicle dealerships that are licensed by the state of Ohio. Of the total used dealerships, 88 of them are pending review for possible board discipline due to violations, 35 are active board cases, 18 are being offered consent agreements (minor physical violations only), and 7 are scheduled to be heard at the next hearing.

b. Identify the nature of all adverse impact (e.g., fees, fines, employer time for compliance); and

   There are initial application fees that do not include the fees for the required used dealer licensing training course, renewal application, and background fees for first time applicants for a used motor vehicle dealer’s license.

   Dealers are required to maintain compliance at all times for the duration of the license. Dealers that fail to maintain compliance with these rules are subject to administrative sanction, but are granted due process and scheduled for an administrative hearing with the motor vehicle dealer board.

c. Quantify the expected adverse impact from the regulation.

   The adverse impact can be quantified in terms of dollars, hours to comply, or other factors; and may be estimated for the entire regulated population or for a “representative business.” Please include the source for your information/estimated impact.

   The requirement for all first time dealer applicants; a state-wide background web check by the Bureau of Criminal Investigations is estimated to range from thirty-five dollars ($35) to forty-five dollars ($45), the initial dealer license fees starting at two hundred fifty-six dollars ($256), with one hundred and fifty dollars ($150) going to the Attorney General for the Title Defect Rescission (TDR) Fund, must obtain a surety bond for $25,000 that is to be filed with the Attorney General’s Office for the TDR (the cost for the surety bond is reflective of the applicants credit history, therefore the cost various), and a net worth of seventy-five thousand dollars ($75,000). For licensed motor vehicle used dealers to maintain their licenses they must renew their permit and dealer plates every two years with renewal fees of fifty dollars ($50) for the permit, fifty dollars ($50) for the dealer master plate, and ten dollars ($10) for each additional dealer plate.

   Any motor vehicle used dealer who violates the rules may be subject to administrative hearing proceedings, in which they may incur costs in legal representation, and travel expenses. Cost vary with the range of legal fees which are set by the legal business and based on the economic price of gas and distance traveled for travel expenses.. Sanctions
from denial of applications up to and including revocation of licenses may be imposed for applicants and dealers who fail to comply with these rules.

17. Why did the Agency determine that the regulatory intent justifies the adverse impact to the regulated business community?

The proposed amendments help assist those who rely on the industry to make a living and maintain compliance and to protect the consumers by ensuring contact with the dealer is made available during a normal business schedule.

**Regulatory Flexibility**

18. Does the regulation provide any exemptions or alternative means of compliance for small businesses? Please explain.

The proposed amendment allows discretion for the dealers to still maintain hours on the weekends and evenings outside of the ten hours, that must be Monday thru Friday.

19. How will the agency apply Ohio Revised Code section 119.14 (waiver of fines and penalties for paperwork violations and first-time offenders) into implementation of the regulation?

The BMV allows for a corrective action for violations within fifteen (15) days of the first violation notice.

20. What resources are available to assist small businesses with compliance of the regulation?

Motor vehicle dealers may call the BMV and speak directly with a dealer licensing customer service assistant and view Ohio Revised Code and Administrative Code requirements via the BMV’s dealer licensing website. These small businesses may also contact an Auto Dealer Association in their respective regions as a useful resource for all motor vehicle dealerships.
MEMORANDUM

TO: Joseph Kirk, Ohio Department of Public Safety

FROM: Ethan Wittkorn, Regulatory Policy Advocate

DATE: February 14, 2020

RE: CSI Review – Requirements for an Established Place of Business for a Used Motor Vehicle Dealer (4501:1-3-08)

On behalf of Lt. Governor Jon Husted, and pursuant to the authority granted to the Common Sense Initiative (CSI) Office under Ohio Revised Code (ORC) section 107.54, the CSI Office has reviewed the abovementioned administrative rule package and associated Business Impact Analysis (BIA). This memo represents the CSI Office’s comments to the Department as provided for in ORC 107.54.

Analysis

This Ohio Department of Public Safety (Department) rule package consists of one amended rule submitted as part of a statutory five-year review process. The rule was submitted to the CSI office on January 7, 2020, and the public comment period was open through January 21, 2020. Unless otherwise noted below, this recommendation reflects the version of the proposed rules filed with the CSI office on January 7, 2020.

The rule outlines the requirements for the operating space of a used motor vehicle dealership. Proposed amendments include rewording of square footage requirements and removal of language specific to retailers with ten vehicles or less and establishing a barrier as a permanent fixture and that office areas must have hard walls and 180 contiguous square feet. Additional changes include updates to require used motor vehicle dealerships to be open to the public for at least 25 hours a week with ten of those hours being between 9:00a.m. and 5:00p.m., as well as requirements for dealerships to notify the registrar when there is a change in hours. The Department states that the updated operating hours are necessary to ensure that consumers, BMV investigators, and the Attorney Generals Office is able to make contact with necessary personnel.
During the early stakeholder outreach period, the Department worked with the Ohio Independent Auto Dealers Association (OIADA) and the Ohio Auto Dealers Association to draft the proposed amendments. One comment of support was submitted by the OIADA during the CSI public comment period.

The rule affects 5,550 licensed used motor vehicle dealerships. Impacts include fees for first time dealer applicants that include a $35-$45 background check and initial licensing fee starting at $256. Additionally, applicants must obtain a $25,000 surety bond to be filed with the Attorney General’s office and have a net worth of $75,000. The Department states that the rules are necessary for consumer protection.

**Recommendations**

Based on the information above, the CSI Office has no recommendations on this rule package.

**Conclusion**

The CSI Office concludes that the Department should proceed in filing the proposed rules with the Joint Committee on Agency Rule Review.
February 18, 2020

Ethan Wittkorn, Regulatory Policy Advocate
Office of Lt. Governor Jon Husted
Common Sense Initiative Office
77 South High Street, 30th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215

Dear Mr. Wittkorn,

Thank you for your review of the Business Impact Analysis for the proposed revisions to Ohio Administrative Rules 4501:1-3-08 (Requirements for an Established Place of Business for a Used Motor Vehicle Dealer). The Ohio Department of Public Safety, Bureau of Motor Vehicles, has received and reviewed your recommendations and conclusions. The Department understands that CSI has no additional recommendations.

The Department intends to file these amend rule and all required materials, with the Joint Committee on Agency Rule Review, the Legislative Service Commission, and the Secretary of State’s office by the end of February 2020.

Regards,

Joseph A. Kirk
Rules Coordinator

cc: Sarah Stedtefeld, Chief, Dealer Licensing Section
    Carrie Kuruc, CSI Director